

# Imbalance sequences of football tournaments (February 6, 2012)

Antal IVÁNYI

Department of Computer Algebra,  
Eötvös Loránd University, Hungary  
email: [tony@inf.elte.hu](mailto:tony@inf.elte.hu)

Loránd LUCZ

Department of Computer Algebra,  
Eötvös Loránd University, Hungary  
email: [lorand-lucz@caesar.elte.hu](mailto:lorand-lucz@caesar.elte.hu)

**Abstract.** An open problem is the complexity to decide whether a sequence of nonnegative integer numbers is the final score sequence of a football tournament [9, 18, ?, ?]. In this paper we propose a polynomial algorithm to decide whether a sequence of nonnegative integers is the imbalance sequence of a football tournament.

## 1 Introduction

Let  $\mathbf{a}$ ,  $\mathbf{b}$  and  $\mathbf{n}$  be nonnegative integers ( $\mathbf{b} \geq \mathbf{a} \geq 0$ ,  $\mathbf{n} \geq 1$ ),  $\mathcal{T}(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{n})$  be the set of directed multigraphs  $T = (V, E)$ , where  $|V| = \mathbf{n}$ , and elements of each pair of different vertices  $u, v \in V$  are connected with at least  $\mathbf{a}$  and at most  $\mathbf{b}$  arcs [15].  $T \in \mathcal{T}(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{n})$  is called  $(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{n})$ -tournament.  $(1, 1, \mathbf{n})$ -tournaments are the usual tournaments, and  $(0, 1, \mathbf{n})$ -tournaments are also called oriented graphs or simple directed graphs [10]. The set  $\mathcal{T}$  is defined by

$$\mathcal{T} = \bigcup_{\mathbf{b} \geq 1, \mathbf{n} \geq 1} \mathcal{T}(0, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{n}).$$

An  $(\mathbf{a}, \mathbf{b}, \mathbf{n})$ -tournament is called *complete*, if the set of permitted results is  $\{0 : c, 1 : c - 1, \dots, c : 0\}$  for all possible  $c$  ( $\mathbf{a} \leq c \leq \mathbf{b}$ ). If some of these results are prohibited, then the tournament is called *incomplete*.

---

**Computing Classification System 1998:** G.2.2. [Graph Theory]: Subtopic - Network problems.

**Mathematics Subject Classification 2010:** 05C85, 68R10

**Key words and phrases:** tournament, imbalance sequence, polynomial algorithm, complexity

The first result on the out-degree sequences of complete  $(1, 1, n)$ -tournaments belongs to Landau, who in 1953 published the following necessary and sufficient condition.

**Theorem 1** *If  $n \geq 1$  then a sequence  $(s_1, \dots, s_n)$  of integers satisfying  $0 \leq s_1 \leq \dots \leq s_n$  is the score sequence of some  $(1, 1, n)$ -tournament  $T$  if and only if*

$$\sum_{i=1}^k s_i \geq B_k, \quad 1 \leq k \leq n, \quad (1)$$

with equality when  $k = n$ .

Further results connected with complete tournaments can be found e.g. in [15, 16, 19, ?].

For example football is an incomplete  $(2, 3, n)$ -tournament since the permitted results are  $0 : 3$  and  $1 : 1$  while  $0 : 2$  and  $1 : 2$  are not permitted.

According to this definition  $\mathcal{T}$  is the set of the finite directed loopless multi-graphs.

For any vertex  $v \in V$  let  $d(v)^+$  and  $d(v)^-$  denote the out-degree and in-degree of  $v$ , respectively. Define  $f(v) = d(v)^+ - d(v)^-$  as the imbalance of the vertex  $v$ . The imbalance sequence of  $T \in \mathcal{T}$  is formed by listing the vertex imbalances of the vertices in nonincreasing or nondecreasing order.

The following result due to Avery [2] and Mubayi, Will and West [?] provides a necessary and sufficient condition for a nonincreasing sequence  $F$  of integers to be the imbalance sequence of a tournament  $T \in \mathcal{T}(0, 1, n)$ .

**Theorem 2** (Avery [2], Mubayi, Will, West [25]) *A nonincreasing sequence of integers  $F = (f_1, \dots, f_n)$  is an imbalance sequence of a  $(0, 1, n)$  tournament if and only if*

$$\sum_{i=1}^k f_i \geq k(n - k),$$

for  $1 \leq k < n$  with equality when  $k = n$ .

**Proof.** See [2, 25]. □

## 2 Imbalance sequences of complete tournaments

In 1991 Avery [2]

In 2001 Mubayi, Will and West [25]

### 3 Incomplete tournaments

The first results on incomplete tournaments were published by Reid and Zhang in 1998.

**Theorem 3** (Reid, Zhang [28]) *If  $n \geq 1$  then the nondecreasing sequence of nonnegative integer numbers  $s = (s_1, \dots, s_n)$  is the outdegree sequence of a semicompleted tournament  $T$  if and only if*

$$\sum_{i=1}^k s_i \geq \binom{k}{2} \quad \text{and} \quad s_k \leq n - 1 \quad (2)$$

for all  $1 \leq k \leq n$ .

**Theorem 4** (Reid, Zhang [28]) *If  $n \geq 1$  and  $s = (s_1, \dots, s_n)$  is a nondecreasing sequence of nonnegative integers, then there exists a tournament  $T$  with out-degree sequence  $t = t_1, \dots, t_n$  such, that  $t_i \leq s_i$  for  $1 \leq i \leq n$ . the outdegree sequence of a semicompleted tournament  $T$  if and only if*

$$\sum_{i=1}^k s_i \geq \binom{k}{2} \quad \text{and} \quad s_k \leq n - 1 \quad (3)$$

for all  $1 \leq k \leq n$ .

**Theorem 5** (Reid, Zhang [28]) *Theorem 2, Theorem 3 and Theorem 4 are equivalent.*

In 2002 Iványi [14] solved the following problem posed by Antal Bege [3]: How many wins are necessary and sufficient in a  $(1, 1, n)$  tournament to guarantee that the teams have different number of points.

Let  $x \geq 0$  be a real number and define *the real football tournament* with the permitted results  $0 : 0$  and  $0 : 0$  and  $-1 : 1 + x$ . Let  $f(x, n)$  denote the above described number of wins in a real football tournament of  $n$  teams.

**Theorem 6** *If  $n \geq 1$  then*

$$f(n, 1) = (3/2 - \sqrt{2})n^2 + O(n), \quad (4)$$

if  $x$  is zero or an integer greater or equal 2, then

$$f(n, x) = \frac{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor (\lfloor n/2 \rfloor + 1)}{2} = \frac{n^2}{8} + \rho(n), \quad (5)$$

where  $\rho(\mathfrak{n}) = 0$ , if  $\mathfrak{n}$  is even and  $\rho(\mathfrak{n}) = 1/8$ , if  $\mathfrak{n} \geq 3$  is odd, and if  $x$  is irrational, then

$$f(\mathfrak{n}, x) = O(\mathfrak{n}^{3/2}). \quad (6)$$

**Proof.** See [14]. □

## 4 Imbalance sequences of football tournaments

Let the permitted results of the *simplified football tournament*  $T_{\mathfrak{n}} 0 : 0$  and  $0 : 1$ .

The following assertion gives a necessary and sufficient condition for a non-increasing sequence  $s = (s_1, \dots, s_{\mathfrak{n}})$  to be the imbalance sequence of a football tournament.

**Theorem 7** *A nonincreasing sequence of integers  $S = (s_1, \dots, s_{\mathfrak{n}})$  is an imbalance sequence of a football tournament if and only if  $s_i$  ( $i = 1, \dots, \mathfrak{n}$ ) is a multiple of 3 and  $s' = (s_1/3, \dots, s_{\mathfrak{n}}/3)$  is the imbalance sequence of a complete  $(0, 1, \mathfrak{n})$ -tournament.*

**Proof.** The result  $1 : 1$  between players  $P_i$  and  $P_j$  do not change the imbalance of  $P_i$  and  $P_j$ . The other possible result  $3 : 0$  adds 3 to the imbalance of  $P_i$  and subtracts 3 from the imbalance of  $P_j$ . Therefore if  $s$  is an imbalance sequence of a football tournament, then all elements of  $s$  are the multiple of 3.

$s$  is the imbalance sequence of a football tournament if and only if  $s'$  is the imbalance sequence of a simplified football tournament.  $s'$  is the imbalance sequence of a simplified football tournament if and only if it is the imbalance sequence of a complete  $(0, 1, \mathfrak{n})$ -tournament. □

## 5 Optimization

## 6 Summary

The referenced papers can be found at the homepage of the author at <http://compalg.inf.elte.hu/~tony/Kutatas/EGHH/>.

**Acknowledgements.** The European Union and the European Social Fund have provided financial support to the project under the grant agreement no. TÁMOP 4.2.1/B-09/1/KMR-2010-0003.

## References

- [1] M. Anholcer, V. Babiy, S. Bozóki, W. W. Koczkodaj, A simplified implementation of the least squares solution for pairwise comparisons matrices. *CEJOR Cent. Eur. J. Oper. Res.* **19**, (4) (2011) 439–444.  $\Rightarrow$
- [2] P. Avery, Score sequences of oriented graphs, *J. Graph Theory* **15**, (3) (1991) 251–257.  $\Rightarrow$  2
- [3] A. Bege, Personal communication, Visegrád, 19998.  $\Rightarrow$  3
- [4] S. Bozóki S., J. Fülöp, A. Poesz: On pairwise comparison matrices that can be made consistent by the modification of a few elements. *CEJOR Cent. Eur. J. Oper. Res.* **19** (2011) 157–175.  $\Rightarrow$
- [5] S. Bozóki: J. Fülöp, L. Rónyai: On optimal completion of incomplete pairwise comparison matrices, *Math. Comput. Modelling* **52** (2010) 318–333.  $\Rightarrow$
- [6] A. R. Brualdi, K. Kiernan: Landau’s and Rado’s theorems and partial tournaments, *Electron. J. Combin.* **16**, (#N2) (2009) 6 pages.  $\Rightarrow$
- [7] T. H. Cormen, Ch. E. Leiserson, R. L. Rivest, C. Stein, *Introduction to Algorithms* Third edition, The MIT Press/McGraw Hill, Cambridge/New York, 2009.  $\Rightarrow$
- [8] P. Erdős, T. Gallai, Graphs with vertices having prescribed degrees (Hungarian), *Mat. Lapok* **11** (1960) 264–274.  $\Rightarrow$
- [9] A. Frank, *Connections in Combinatorial Optimization*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2011.  $\Rightarrow$  1
- [10] J. L. Gross, J. Yellen, *Handbook of Graph Theory*, CRC Press, Boca Raton, 2004.  $\Rightarrow$  1
- [11] S. L. Hakimi, On the realizability of a set of integers as degrees of the vertices of a simple graph. *J. SIAM Appl. Math.* **10** (1962) 496–506.  $\Rightarrow$
- [12] S. L. Hakimi, On the degrees of the vertices of a graph, *F. Franklin Institute*, **279**, (4) (1965) 290–308.  $\Rightarrow$
- [13] V. Havel, A remark on the existence of finite graphs (Czech), *Časopis Pěst. Mat.* **80** (1955), 477–480.  $\Rightarrow$

- [14] A. Iványi, Maximal tournaments. *Pure Math. Appl.* **13**, (1–2) (2002) 171–183.  $\Rightarrow$  [3](#), [4](#)
- [15] A. Iványi, Reconstruction of complete interval tournaments, *Acta Univ. Sapientiae, Inform.*, **1(1)**, (2009) 71–88.  $\Rightarrow$  [1](#), [2](#)
- [16] A. Iványi, Reconstruction of complete interval tournaments. II, *Acta Univ. Sapientiae, Math.*, **2**, (1) (2010) 47–71.  $\Rightarrow$  [2](#)
- [17] A. Iványi, Deciding the validity of the score sequence of a soccer tournament, in: *Open problems of the* (ed. by A. Frank), *Egerváry Research Group*, Budapest, 2011.  $\Rightarrow$
- [18] A. Iványi, Degree sequences of multigraphs. *Annales Univ. Sci. Budapest., Sect. Computatorica* (submitted).  $\Rightarrow$  [1](#)
- [19] A. Iványi, L. Lucz, F. T. Móri, P. Sótér, On the Erdős-Gallai and Havel-Hakimi algorithms. *Acta Univ. Sapientiae, Inform.* **3**, (2) (2011) 230–268.  $\Rightarrow$  [2](#)
- [20] A. Iványi, S. Pirzada, Comparison based ranking, in: ed. A. Iványi, *Algorithms of Informatics, Vol. 3, AnTonCom*, Budapest 2011, 1209–1258.  $\Rightarrow$
- [21] G. Kéri, On qualitatively consistent, transitive and contradictory judgment matrices emerging from multiattribute decision procedures, *CEJOR Cent. Eur. J. Oper. Res.* **19**, (2) (2011) 215–224.  $\Rightarrow$
- [22] K. Kern, D. Paulusma, The new FIFA rules are hard: complexity aspects of sport competitions, *Discrete Appl. Math.* **108**, (3) (2001) 317–323.  $\Rightarrow$
- [23] K. Kern, D. Paulusma, The computational complexity of the elimination problem in generalized sports competitions, *Discrete Optimization* **1** (2004) 205–214.  $\Rightarrow$
- [24] H. G. Landau, On dominance relations and the structure of animal societies. III. The condition for a score sequence, *Bull. Math. Biophys.* **15**, (1953) 143–148.  $\Rightarrow$
- [25] Mubayi, D., T. G. Will and D. B. West, Realizing degree imbalances in directed graphs, *Discrete Math.* **239**, (1–3) (2001) 147–153.  $\Rightarrow$  [2](#)

- 
- [26] T. V. Narayana, D. H. Bent, Computation of the number of score sequences in round-robin tournaments, *Canad. Math. Bull.* **7**, (1) (1964) 133–136.  $\Rightarrow$
- [27] G. Pécsy, L. Szűcs, Parallel verification and enumeration of tournaments, *Stud. Univ. Babeş-Bolyai, Inform.* **45**, (2) (2000) 11–26.  $\Rightarrow$
- [28] K. B. Reid, C. Q. Zhang, Score sequences of semicomplete digraphs, *Bull. Inst. Combin. Appl.* **24** (1998) 27–32.  $\Rightarrow$  3
- [29] D. Soroker, Optimal parallel construction of prescribed tournaments, *Discrete Appl. Math.* **29**, (1) (1990) 113–125.  $\Rightarrow$
- [30] J. Temesi, Pairwise comparison matrices and the error-free property of the decision maker, *CEJOR Cent. Eur. J. Oper. Res.* **19**, (2) (2011) 239–249.  $\Rightarrow$